```
<!DOCTYPE HTML PUBLIC "-//W3C//DTD HTML 4.0 Transitional//EN">
<html>
<head>
    <meta http-equiv="content-type" content="text/html;</pre>
charset=utf-8">
    <title></title>
    <meta name="generator" content="LibreOffice 4.2.6.3</pre>
(Linux)">
    <meta name="author" content="DJB">
   <meta name="created" content="20130523;12550000000000">
    <meta name="changed" content="20130523;16200000000000">
    <meta name="Company" content="CHV">
    <meta name="Operator" content="DJB">
    <style type="text/css">
    <!--
       @page { margin-left: 3.18cm; margin-right: 3.18cm;
margin-top: 2.54cm; margin-bottom: 2.54cm }
       p { margin-bottom: 0.25cm; line-height: 120% }
    -->
    </style>
</head>
<body lang="en-ZA" dir="ltr">
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">IN
THE COURT OF APPEAL OF SWAZILAND</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">APPEAL
CASE NO.65/01 </span></font></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">In
the matter between:</span></font>
```

```
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">CHRISTIAN
           1st APPELLANT</span></font>
OBI MACREA
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">NELSON
MASEK0
           2nd APPELLANT</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">VS</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">THE
KING RESPONDENT</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">CORAM
        BROWDE JA</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
```

```
1.27cm; margin-bottom: 0cm; line-height: 100%; widows: 0;
orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">STEYN
JA </span></font></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
1.27cm; margin-bottom: 0cm; line-height: 100%; widows: 0;
orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">TEBBUTT
JA</span></font></fo>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">FOR
            1st APPELLANT IN
PERSON</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">FOR
            2nd APPELLANT IN
PERSON</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">FOR
CROWN
            MR. N. MASEKO</span></font>
```

```
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">JUDGMENT</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
1.27cm; margin-bottom: 0cm; line-height: 100%; widows: 0;
orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">Tebbutt
JA</span></font></fo>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">In
the High Court, before Nkambule J, six persons were arraigned.
Thev
were variously charged with seven counts of robbery, one of
kidnapping, five counts of contraventions of the ARMS AND
AMMUNITION
ACT NO.24 of 1964 (as amended) (the Act) and a count of murder.
Αt
the</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
<q\>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">2</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<hr>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
```

```
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">commencement
of the trial, the Crown abandoned two of the robbery counts and
requested a separation of the murder count from the others, which
granted.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">At
the conclusion of the Crown case at the trial, two of the accused
persons were acquitted and discharged on all the counts with
which
they were charged and at the end of trial as a whole a sixth
accused
was similarly found not guilty and
discharged.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">0f
the remaining three accused, Accused No.l, James Ijeoma was found
quilty on one of the robbery counts and on the kidnapping count,
as
well as of being in possession of a 9mm parabellum firearm and of
and 16 rounds of ammunition for it i.e. of three counts under the
Act. The robbery and kidnapping counts were treated as one for
the
purposes of sentence, which was one of seven years imprisonment
on the three counts under the Act, also treated as one for
sentencing
purposes, he was fined E5 000 or five years imprisonment, the
sentences to run concurrently.</span></font>
```

```
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">Accused
No.2, Christian Obi Macrea, was found guilty on one count of
robberv
and sentenced to seven years
imprisonment.</font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">Accused
No.3 was convicted on five of the robbery counts, on the
kidnapping
count and on two counts under the Act i.e. of being in possession
two AK47 rifles and 126 rounds of ammunition for them. On the one
robbery and the kidnapping count, he was sentenced to seven years
imprisonment. This was also his sentence on each of the other
four
robbery counts and on the two counts under the Act, taken
together
for sentencing purposes, he was sentenced to five years
imprisonment.
All his sentences were ordered to run concurrently. The sentences
on
all three accused were backdated to 11th September
2000.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">3</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
```

```
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">0f
the three accused, two of them, Accused No.2 and No.3 have
appealed
to this Court against their convictions and sentences, as
appellants
Nos 1 and 2 respectively. To avoid confusion, I shall refer to
herein either by their names or as they were cited in the court a
quo
i.e. as Macrea or Accused No.2 (A2) and as Maseko or Accused No.3
(A3). Accused No.l, Ijeoma (A1), has not
appealed.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">The
facts show that the three accused were part of a group that were
involved in a series of robberies, some of them involving the use
of
firearms, in the Ezulwini, Mdzimba and Ngwenya areas between 14th
June and 23rd August 2000. Also involved with them was one Albert
Sabelo Shongwe, who, as an accomplice, was the main Crown witness
the trial. I shall refer to him, as he was at the trial, as
Sabelo.
He knew all three accused. He testified that on 14th June 2000,
was introduced by A3 to a Nigerian national by the name of Steve
asked them to kidnap a Chinese woman whose brother owed him some
money. Steve said he would get another Nigerian to assist them.
Не
was A1. At about 5.45pm that day a Chinese woman, Jenny
Kwokchoon,
was held up at qunpoint by A1 as she drove up in her car to her
```

Sabelo and A3 forced her back into the car. She was blindfolded,

up and held by them at Pine Valley where they used her cell phone

```
to
telephone her brother to demand a ransom of El million. At about
she was released, the man Steve saying that they had kidnapped
the
wrong person. She was allowed to drive her car home. She was
unharmed
but they took her cell phone, her purse with E400 in it, a gold
and some CDs which were later found during a search of Al's home.
These facts formed the basis of the robbery and kidnapping
charges on
which A1 and A3 were convicted. A1 was arrested on 11th September
2000. A 9mm pistol was found in his possession. It was loaded
with 11
rounds of</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">4</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">ammunition
and a further 16 rounds were found during the search of his
premises
after his subsequent arrest.</span></font></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">Sabelo
further testified that in August 2000 he, A3 and another
accomplice,
who also testified, one Collen Magagula, hatched a plan to rob
the
```

Mantenga Bottle Store at Ezulwini. At about 6pm on 1st August, the

three of them went to the bottle store. He and A3 were each armed with a rifle, which A3 had provided. He fired a warning shot which

frightened off a security guard there.'. He also shot a dog which

guarding the premises. They entered the bottle store, whose employees

had run away in fright, and took El900 which was in a bag near the

till and which the three of them shared. A3 was arrested on 10th September 2000. After his arrest, according to Detective Superintendent Jomo Mavuso, who was in charge of the investigation of

these robberies, A3 took them to the Mkhondolwane River at Ezulwini,

just below the Mantenga Bottle Store. Sabelo, who was also under arrest, was with them. A3 and the police dug in the sand there

retrieved a white sack in which there were two AK47 rifles and two

magazines loaded with nine and sixteen live rounds of ammunition respectively. Sabelo identified the rifles as those used in the robbery of the bottle store. An independent witness, Varaza Mkhwanazi, who was present at the time, corroborated the police evidence. These facts formed the basis of the Crown case on one of

the robbery counts and on the counts against A3 under the Act.

height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">

widows: 0; orphans: 0">

<font size="2" style="font-size:</pre> 10pt">0n

the other two robbery counts on which A3 was convicted, Sabelo described how on 8th August 2000 he and A3 had hijacked a car on the

Tea Road, using a rifle to get the car to stop. The owner of the

had fought with them as they were driving off in the car until he was

able to free himself and run off into the darkness. They then proceeded to Mbabane in the car. The owner corroborated Sabelo's

```
evidence. That car</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">5</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<hr>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">a
Toyota Corolla, was used as a get away car in the second of the
two
robberies. This was the hijacking of a car in which a fruit and
vegetable merchant, who had El6,500 with him to use in buying
supplies in South Africa for his store, was travelling. The
said that near Beral in Ngwenya a Toyota Corolla blocked their
way.
Sabelo said he, A3 and another one of the accused, who was later
acquitted; were in the latter car, A3 and the other accused, using
firearms, demanded money from the merchant. They took the E16,500
and
another E10 from the merchant's driver. They then went to
Mbangweni
..where they abandoned the Toyota Corolla and shared the money.
Sabelo said he got E3,000 as his share. A3 went off with the
firearms.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">0n
23 August 2000, so Sabelo said, he met Al, A2 and A3 at Ezulwini
they decided to get a car for a robbery at Manzini. A2 would go
the Casino at the Sun International Hotel and get a car. He came
```

back in a Toyota Corolla, in which he was a passenger, Sabelo said he pointed a gun at the driver who was forced into the boot of the They then drove towards Mbabane, As they were travelling Sabelo noticed that the driver had removed the right tail light of the car and was waving from the boot to the traffic to stop the car. They stopped and put the driver out of the car before proceeding further towards Mbabane. They then noticed that a car was following them. They gave this car the slip in the Sidwashini Industrial area where they abandoned the Corolla and decided to separate. Sabelo took battery of the Corolla. The driver of the Corolla, Lucky Maseko, taxi driver at the Sun International Hotel, testified that A2 came to him in the presence of a security guard looking for another taxi driver, one John, who was not available, Maseko offered to take A2 to where he wanted to go. He described how they picked up two other on route and how the three men forced him into the boot of his car at gunpoint. He described how he removed the right tail light and waved to traffic for assistance; how he was forced out of the car; how height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
 widows: 0; orphans: 0"> <font size="2" style="font-size:</pre> 10pt">6 height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
 <q\> widows: 0; orphans: 0"> <font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>

called the police; how he and the police spotted his car and

10pt">he

```
followed
it until they lost it in the Industrial area; and how it was
found abandoned, with the battery missing. Maseko said he had
every
opportunity of seeing A2 at the Casino where the area was well
and also when he was forced into the boot. He later identified
him at
a police identification parade. The security guard, Charles
Dlamini,
said he saw A2 at a garage near the Casino. A2, who was acting
suspiciously, said he was looking for a taxi driver called John.
Dlamini said he accompanied him to the Sun International taxi
John was not there. He introduced A2 to Maseko who offered to
A2 to wherever he wanted to go. Dlamini also said that the taxi
was brightly lit and he saw A2 very clearly. He too identified
him at
the police identification parade.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">It
will be appreciated that the convictions of both the appellants
based mainly on the evidence of the accomplice, Sabelo. The trial
Court found him to be a " reliable and trustworthy
witness".</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">It
is a well-known principle that a court on appeal will not upset a
credibility finding made by a trial court unless it is manifestly
incorrect. That cannot be said in this case in regard to Sabelo.
His
```

```
evidence on the record reads well and convincingly. He was
subjected
to a searching cross-examination by the appellants but came
it unscathed, answering the questions put to him promptly and
confidently. He was also corroborated on the salient features of
of the counts by the Crown witnesses who testified on those
Although an accomplice, his evidence was correctly accepted by
trial court.</span></font>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">In
his appeal in this Court, A2 submitted that he had been denied
right to recall for cross-examination the taxi driver Maseko. He
was,
however, when Maseko testified, represented by counsel who
certainly</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<hr>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">7</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">cross-examined
him and no fault can be found with the trial Judge's refusal to
have
him recalled. A2 also complained that he had been denied the
right to
get his own counsel to represent him. He was initially
represented by
counsel who later withdraw from the case. The trial Judge took
considerable pains to allow A2 to obtain another legal
representative. He could not do so. However, A2 subjected the
```

```
witnesses, especially Charles Dlamini and the police who
conducted
the identification parade to a thorough, penetrating and, if I
add, for a layman, competent cross-examination. He had a
perfectly
fair trial. He further submitted that nothing placed him at the
scene
of the crime and that no case had been proved against him. The
witnesses Maseko and Charles Dlamini positively identified him,
at a
properly conducted identification parade, as a participant in the
robbery of Maseko, which was also the evidence of Sabelo. He was
correctly convicted of the charge against him and his appeal
against
his conviction must fail.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">A3
on appeal pointed to what he said were contradictions in the
evidence. Most of these are completely insignificant and
irrelevant
and often ridiculous e.g. one witness saying on one count that
assailants carried guns while another said there was only one
another saying that the hijacked car was a red one while yet
another
said it was maroon one (maroon is, of course, a shade of red!). I
need not detail the others. They in no way detract from the
overall
credibility of the Crown witnesses and particularly that of
Sabelo.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">A3
said the evidence as to his pointing out the whereabouts of the
```

```
AK47
rifles was fabricated by the police. There is no suggestion by
to why they should have done so. Their evidence was explicit and
clearly unbiased and, in any event, it is supported by the
independent witness, Varaza Mkhwanazi. A3 was also correctly
convicted on all the counts</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">8</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">with
which he was charged and his appeal against his convictions must
fail
as well.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<hr>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">As
to the sentences, these were lenient in the extreme. I find it
hard
to comprehend how an accused person who was convicted of five
counts
of robbery and of being in possession of two AK47 rifles which
were
used in some of those robberies, as A3 was, could have been
sentenced
to only an effective seven years in prison. He was one of a group
robbers who terrorized the community with their unlawful
activities.
His misdeeds clearly justified a substantially higher period of
```

```
incarceration. Mr. Maseko for the Crown agreed that the sentence
on
A3 was extremely lenient. Sentencing is, of course, in the
discretion
of the trial court. However, crimes of violence which are, from
Court's experience, on the increase in the Kingdom, require
iudicial
officers to use the one tool available to them to try to curb
them
viz the passing of sentences of suitable severity. Individual
circumstances may naturally dictate the imposition of sentences
which
may be less severe. No such circumstances are present in this
case.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">A3's
sentences must therefore stand as they are. As to A2's sentence,
he
complained that in the light of the sentences on A3, his sentence
seven years was, by comparison, out of proportion and too heavy.
While the Court looks to consistency in sentencing the fact that
sentence is too lenient does not, however, justify the Court's
reducing a sentence which is, in the circumstances, an
appropriate
and condign one, as A2's sentence is.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">The
appeals of both appellants against their sentences are
accordingly
also dismissed.</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
```

```
<br
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">The
Court therefore makes the following
order:</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
<q\>
widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">9</span></font>
height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
<br>
<q\>
<0l>
   height: 100%; widows: 0; orphans: 0">
   <font face="Arial, serif"><font size="2" style="font-size:</pre>
10pt"><span lang="en-US">The
   appeals of both appellants, Christian Obi Macrea, and Nelson
DAY OF NOVEMBER 2004</span></font>
</body>
</html>
```